



Legislation Text

File #: 18-508, **Version:** 1

DATE: October 11, 2018

TO: Members of the Northfield Heritage Preservation Commission

FROM: Scott Tempel, City Planner

Reunion - 501, 503, & 505 Division Street - project and paint color update

ACTION REQUESTED:

The HPC is requested to confirm the Certificate of Appropriateness for Reunion at 501, 503, & 505 Division Street South.

BACKGROUND:

The former J. Grundy's Rueb 'N' Stein restaurant located in three historic buildings at 501, 503 & 505 Division Street is currently under renovation. The project includes a major renovation of the building interior, which is outside the purview of HPC review. Exterior alterations & rehabilitation requires a Certificate of Appropriateness approved by the HPC to assure they are meeting the Downtown Preservation Design Guidelines.

The owner's representative gave a presentation on their proposed renovations at the November 2017 HPC meeting. This included:

- Replacing all storefronts with new doors, windows, awnings and light fixtures
- All three storefronts need new paint and repairs done to molding and trim
- Utilize the dumpster area as a street level patio and replace the back deck
- Adding windows to the 5th Street corner

The initial proposal to add windows on the north side of 501 Division on the 5th Street corner is no longer included in the project. During the interior demolition process, the developer discovered that the windows along Division Street originally extended all the way up to the ceiling. They plan to bring them back to their original size and configuration. The corner door will stay the same and the angled front on building 505 will be straightened out even with the rest of the buildings. All the windows on the first floor will be replaced for energy efficiency, but will look the same and adhere to HPC's regulations.

The HPC reviewed the updated proposal at its April 2018 meeting. Guidance was provided to the developer on replacement windows, colors and lighting. The architect incorporated the guidance provided by the HPC and received their Certificate of Appropriateness on June 7, 2018, conditioned on revising the paint color to accentuate architectural detail. A subcommittee met with the applicants and agreed on the new paint color.

In the meantime, the applicants applied for a loan from the Small Business Administration. SBA

loans require Section 106 review from the State Preservation Office (SHPO). SHPO believed the absence of an entrance door to the 503 building was a violation of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The applicant agreed to install a recessed doorway in the original location as an emergency exit. SHPO also requested the storefront cornice on the 505 building to be removed.

ANALYSIS:

The following is a summary of the staff analysis and findings for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Approval Criteria

The heritage preservation commission shall consider the following in evaluating an application for a certificate of appropriateness for a zoning certificate and/or building permit. Criterion (1) below must be met and criteria (2) through (5) shall be considered:

- (1) That it fully complies with all applicable requirements of this LDC;
- (2) That the proposed action is in harmony with the intent of the H-O district;
- (3) That the proposed action would complement other structures within the H-O district;
- (4) That the proposed action is consistent with the Downtown Preservation Design Guidelines; and
- (5) In the case of removal or demolition, that the structure could not be rehabilitated and used for a conforming purpose with reasonable efforts or whether the structure is without substantial historic or architectural significance.

Findings:

1. The LDC Site Development Standards for the C1 Downtown district are found in Table 3.2-5. The zoning states building design and materials must be consistent with the City of Northfield Downtown Historic Preservation Design Guidelines and the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. HPC approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness constitutes compliance with the LDC.

The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation contain standards for a Preservation, Rehabilitation, Restoration, or Reconstruction Project. This project falls under Rehabilitation. According to Department of the Interior guidelines: "Rehabilitation is defined as the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values. In Rehabilitation, historic building materials and character-defining features are protected and maintained as they are in the treatment Preservation. However, greater latitude is given in the Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings to replace extensively deteriorated, damaged, or missing features using either the same material or compatible substitute materials. Of the four treatments, only Rehabilitation allows alterations and the construction of a new addition, if necessary for a continuing or new use for the historic building."

2. The Downtown Historic District has the purpose to:
 - (a) Safeguard the heritage of the city by preserving sites and structures which reflect elements of the city's cultural, social, economic, political, visual or architectural

history;

- (b) Protect and enhance the city's appeal to residents, visitors and tourists and serve as a support and stimulus to business and industry;
- (c) Foster civic pride in the beauty and notable accomplishments of the past; and,
- (d) Promote the preservation and continued use of historic sites and structures for the education and general welfare of the people of the city.

Investment in this property will serve to safeguard and improve a structure important to the city's social, economic and architectural history.

This project will enhance the city's appeal to residents, visitors and tourists by providing high end dining facilities currently lacking in the downtown.

Rehabilitation of this historic structure will ensure the continued use of the historic building while fostering a sense of community pride by having a landmark establishment on a key downtown intersection.

- 3. The proposed rehabilitation will restore many missing elements of the original buildings, bringing the buildings closer to the original design which is consistent with the historical context. Having a refurbished building more closely matching the original is complementary and respectful to other neighboring historic buildings.
- 4. The proposed project is consistent with the Downtown Preservation Design Guidelines. The Guidelines provide for several building project categories. This project fits under the following category:

Renovation: For buildings that have been modified extensively

Many buildings benefit from some degree of renovation using modern materials and techniques that convey the character of missing original features. But it is important to preserve the integrity of an aged building. Renovation often involves the undoing of previous generations of maintenance, such as removing layers of old paint, peeling off applied wood siding, and uncovering original floors. This process involves stripping away one or more layers of "modernization."

The proposal meets the general storefront design considerations in the Guidelines in regards to design, transparency and architectural detail. It also uses appropriate materials per the Guidelines:

The color and texture of the storefront materials should be simple and unobtrusive: (1) The storefront frame can be wood, cast iron, or aluminum with a baked enamel finish; (2) the display windows should be clear glass; (3) transom windows may be clear, prism, or stained glass; (4) the entrance door should have a large glass panel and can be made of wood, steel, or aluminum; (5) the base panels (bulkheads) can be of wood, polished stone, glass, tile, or aluminum-clad plywood panels; (6) the storefront cornice can be made of wood, cast iron, or sheet metal or sometimes the horizontal supporting

beam can serve as the storefront cap; (7) the side piers should be of the same material as the upper facade.

5. Not Applicable. The building is not being demolished.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness