



Legislation Text

File #: Ord. 995, **Version:** 1

City Council Meeting Date: February 20, 2018

To: Mayor and City Council
City Administrator

From: Scott Tempel, City Planner

Consideration of Heritage Preservation Site Designation Ordinance for Downtown Properties

Action Requested:

The Northfield City Council approves the second reading of an Ordinance approving Heritage Preservation Site Designation in the Northfield Historic District.

Summary Report:

Item continued from the January 16 City Council meeting due to concerns that affected property owners were not notified. All affected owners have received a mailed notice of this meeting from staff and a letter from the HPC inviting the owners to discuss any concerns.

The Heritage Preservation Commission (HPC) is recommending the City of Northfield add four properties to the Northfield Historic District. The Ordinance before the City Council begins the process by locally designating the properties as Heritage Preservation Sites. It also fulfills an important step in maintaining the City's status as a Certified Local Government (CLG) with the state and federal government. CLG status enables the local government to apply for federal matching grants to preserve historic properties. This local-state-federal partnership encourages the integration of historic preservation into local government policy. The HPC is supposed to demonstrate an ongoing process of local designation with a minimum of one designation a year. Northfield has not designated any new properties in decades.

The Planning Commission (PC) reviewed the HPC proposal at its May 2017 meeting and recommended approval by the City Council. The PC agreed the library should remain in the Historic District, as it both benefits and adds value to the district. The PC also recommended a change in the proposed district boundary to include more of the park property adjacent to Bridge Square. The PC received no public comment during their review process.

The official public hearing for the ordinance per the published notice announcing amendments to the district was held before the City Council on June 6, 2017. At this hearing, two of the affected property owners spoke against being included in the district. The owners of Imminent Brewing also spoke against being included in the district. It should be noted, the brewery property was not a separate parcel at the time of the survey and Imminent had already received consent for the brewery project from the HPC during advisory review. Following the public hearing, the City Council requested staff provide additional information at a future meeting.

Based upon the City Council request, an informational presentation providing additional details on the Historic District was provided on October 10, 2017. This presentation detailed the history of the Historic District and the function of the HPC. It also went over the impact to property owners of being in the district as summarized below.

Impacts of the three layers of designation are summarized below:

National Register District

- Sets boundary for Overlay Zone
- Recognizes significance of properties
- Makes available tax incentives and grants
- Limited protection for federally assisted projects only
- Does not restrict the use of property or obligate private property owners in any way

Local Heritage Preservation Site

- Protects properties with design controls
- Protects designated properties against demolition
- Provides protection for designated properties outside the Historic District
- Does not restrict property use or require property owners to make improvements

Downtown Historic District Overlay Zone

- Sets zone for HPC review of projects
- Identical to National Register Historic District
- Protects properties with design controls through Certificate of Appropriateness
- Overlay zoning in addition to base C1 zoning which applies to all downtown properties

If the local Heritage Preservation Site Designation is approved, the properties will be nominated to the National Register of Historic Places for inclusion in the Northfield Historic District. Upon approval, the district boundary will be amended which will automatically trigger an update to the Downtown Historic District Overlay Zone.

Background:

In February of 2015, the Northfield Heritage Preservation Commission applied for grant funds from the State Historic Society to update the survey of the Northfield Historic District. The grant request was to update survey information for all buildings in the Historic District and to evaluate the buildings in the adjacent commercial area to see if others could be included in the district or if an additional district could be created.

The State Historic Society awarded a \$12,000 Certified Local Government (CLG) grant to the City of Northfield in 2015. The total estimated project cost was \$20,000 so the HPC applied for an additional \$8,000 from the Minnesota Historical & Cultural Heritage Legacy Grant program. The HPC was not successful with this application, so the HPC requested additional funds from the General Fund. At the December 8, 2015 City Council meeting, the City Council approved the use of \$8,000 from the Community Development Department's Planning Division budget for 2016 in order to move the project forward.

A request for proposals (RFP) for consultant services was issued on January 6, 2016 and five proposals were received. The proposals were reviewed by a subcommittee of the HPC and the contract was awarded to

Landscape Research in February of 2016. Landscape Research began the survey work in March of 2016. The survey work continued throughout the summer of 2016 and the consultant provided several updates to the HPC. The consultants completed the survey at the end of 2016 and provided a final report at the March 2017 HPC meeting.

This project followed guidelines established by the Secretary of the Interior for preservation planning and the Guidelines for History/Architecture Projects in Minnesota provided by the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO). Survey work by the consultant consisted of researching the history of each building, photography, evaluation of historic significance, and completion of a new inventory form. The survey was completed in July, 2016 and submitted to SHPO. SHPO accepted the report and its recommendations.

The HPC reviewed the survey forms and the final report. They agreed to the recommended additions and boundary changes, except they decided the Northfield Library should remain within the district. While the consultants made their recommendation based on the most recent standards, the HPC recognized that both additions went through review by the HPC and were approved based on adherence to the Secretary of the Interior's standards and their interpretation at the time. The HPC felt it would be disingenuous to remove the library from the district and recommends keeping it in the district as a non-contributing structure. The HPC received no public comment during the review process.

The report provides the following information on the Northfield Historic context.

The Northfield Commercial Historic District's original 65 properties include some of the earliest portions of the Ames Mill (1856), the Northfield Lyceum (1857), the YMCA (1885), the Northfield Public Library (1910), and the Post Office (1936). Masonry commercial structures dating from 1868-1910 comprise the primary building types.

The densely-built streetscape is comprised of buildings designed to house retail and office as well as artisan and manufacturing use. There are seven remaining "anchor" buildings on key Division Street corners, each distinguished by its bulk, architectural treatment, and prominent roofline. The corner turret of the Central Block (1893) commands a view of the entire district including the Cannon River and mill dam. The Central Block was exemplary of the mixed-use commercial building, with retail shops, banks and offices at the ground level, offices and apartments or manufacturing space at the second level, and a meeting hall used by fraternal and other groups at the top level.

Three periods of Northfield's growth are represented in the historic district. The earliest, from 1856 to 1880, resulted in a compact downtown focused on Bridge Square on both sides of the river and along Division Street between 2nd and 5th Streets. Many frame and a few stone and brick Italianate commercial structures were based on the diagram of retail and service shops on the first floor with offices, apartments and sometimes shops and manufacturing space above. Significant survivors are the Bjoraker Building (1870), which retains its façade of massive limestone piers, the limestone Scriver Building (1868) at the corner of Bridge Square, and the limestone and brick Scofield Building (1878), an important early corner anchor for Division Street. A total of 19 buildings survive from this period.

Downtown Northfield took on much of its current configuration from 1880-1900. A total of 29 buildings remain from this period, including the Nutting (First National Bank), Central, Holland, and McClaughry blocks, reflecting Victorian Italianate, Romanesque Revival, and Neo-Classical influenced styles. The infill along each block is typically a retail storefront with upper-level offices or apartments. Wood and metal cornices with elaborate window framing, cast-iron storefronts, and a lively array of

overhanging signs enriched the uniform setback and continuous street wall. Canvas awnings obscured much of the storefront detail, which typically relied on a recessed entry between glazed storefronts and transoms.

The National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) is the official list of districts, sites, buildings, structures and objects significant in American history, architecture, archaeology, engineering, and culture. A property can be significant at the local, state, or national level. The criteria are:

- Criterion A-association with the events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history;
- Criterion B-association with the lives of persons significant in our past;
- Criterion C-embodiment of the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction; representation of the work of a master; possession of high artistic values; or representation of a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.
- Criterion D-potential to yield information important to prehistory or history.

The survey of the 38 properties located outside the Northfield Historic District suggests only the Northfield Armory may be potentially eligible for individual listing as a National Historic Register Property (NHRP) and evaluation will require research demonstrating the building's significance to the local community within the institutional context. Only three other properties possess enough significance or integrity to recommend their addition to the district. Two of the three are the two retail buildings immediately north of the Armory. On the west side of the river, the small stone-faced building (1940) at 107 W. 3rd Street, behind Plummer Corner at 300 Water Street, is also recommended for inclusion within the historic district.

The consultant found the Northfield Library has been modified to the extent where the original building lacks historic integrity and believes it is no longer contributing to the district, according to current standards. However, after discussion at its last meeting, the HPC is recommending the library remain in the district. The HPC believes it would be disingenuous to remove the library from the district considering both additions to the library received HPC approval and were confirmed to have followed the Secretary of Interiors Standards for Rehabilitation. The Library Director was consulted and also feels the facility should remain in the district as it adds value to the brand and connects the library to the historic downtown.

The analysis language from the inventory forms is provided below:

515 Division St. S. - Significance and Evaluation

This building was not included in the Northfield Commercial Historic District (1979). It was evaluated using National Register of Historic Places criteria (National Register Bulletin 15). Under Criterion A, building construction falls within the Northfield "Commerce, 1856-1945" historic context timeframe during a decade when there was only a small amount of new commercial construction in the city. The building is a well-conserved example of a stone-clad retail or office structure, which employed regionally-sourced masonry, and the exterior retains good historic integrity. Under Criterion C, it does not embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, represent the work of a master, or possess high artistic values. Based on its inclusion within the district's period of significance and its exterior integrity, the building is recommended as contributing to the Northfield Commercial Historic District.

517 Division St. S. - Significance and Evaluation

This building was not included in the Northfield Commercial Historic District (1979). It was evaluated using

National Register of Historic Places criteria (National Register Bulletin 15). Under Criterion A, related to the building's contribution to early twentieth-century downtown development, construction falls within the Northfield "Commerce, 1856-1945" historic context timeframe during a decade when there was only a small amount of new commercial construction in the city. 517 Division Street is typical of simple brick-veneer retail or office structures added to the Northfield downtown area. Like their predecessors, these buildings supplied retail or office space at the first floor and living quarters at the second. The upper story retains good historic integrity, but primarily because of the alteration of stucco cladding the ground level integrity is fair. The historic cast-iron corner column remains, and the angled treatment of the entry is intact. Under Criterion C, it does not embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, represent the work of a master, or possess high artistic values. The building is recommended as contributing to the Northfield Commercial Historic District.

519 Division St. S., Northfield Armory - Significance and Evaluation

The Northfield Armory was not included in the Northfield Commercial Historic District (1979). In 2004 the property was evaluated as part of a Minnesota Army National Guard Armory study that did not recommend NRHP eligibility related to statewide military significance; it was evaluated with the context "Early Period Armories in Minnesota, 1911-1917," which did note its excellent integrity (Blythe 2004). The evaluation, however, did not fully address potential local significance. In 2016 it had preliminary evaluation for local significance using National Register of Historic Places criteria (National Register Bulletin 15). Under Criterion A, building construction falls within the Northfield "Public Institutions, 1857-1945" historic context and timeframe. The current evaluation recommends a period of significance for local significance as 1915 through the National Register 50-year cut-off date of 1966. The building retains excellent historic integrity and is recommended as potentially contributing to the Northfield Commercial Historic District. Further study and local context development is recommended.

107 3rd St. W. - Significance and Evaluation

This building was not included in the Northfield Commercial Historic District (1979). It was evaluated using National Register of Historic Places criteria (National Register Bulletin 15). Under Criterion A, building construction falls within the Northfield "Commerce, 1856-1945" historic context timeframe during a decade when there was only a small amount of new construction in the city but when post-war growth was anticipated. This building is a well conserved example of a stone-clad retail or office structure which employed regionally-sourced masonry with a modern appearance and the exterior retains good historic integrity. Under Criterion C, it does not embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, represent the work of a master, or possess high artistic values. The building is recommended as contributing to the Northfield Commercial Historic District.

210 Washington St. S., Northfield Library

This building is primarily associated with the second period of Northfield's community development, from ca. 1900 to 1945, when the city's downtown achieved much of its present form. The building is associated with the Northfield historic context, "Public Institutions and Improvements, 1857-1945 (Northfield Preservation Plan, 1992).

This property was listed on the NRHP in 1979 as contributing to the Northfield Commercial Historic District. Subsequent remodeling has had a significant impact on the historic building and the Washington Street elevation retains poor integrity, although conservation of the E. 3rd Street elevation results in fair to good integrity when seen from Division Street and the surrounding historic district. Overall, however, the building does not retain enough integrity to remain contributing to the district.

This action is for local historic district designation only. Local designation provides stronger protection for historic properties than National Register listing. If the City desires to update the National Register District, it will require a separate process involving approval by the National Park Service.

Review of historic documents revealed the historic district has never received official local designation. A summary of the history of the district is attached. Staff is suggesting all parcels in the district receive official designation as a local Heritage Preservation Site.

Downtown Historic District Overlay Boundary change

In addition to adding and deleting properties, it is recommended the district boundary be amended to improve accuracy. The changes recommended on the attached map reflect boundary edits to match the district with parcel lines.

By definition in the Land Development Code, the DH-O Downtown Historic District overlay zone is the boundary of the Northfield Downtown Historic District that has been registered with the federal government and certified by the state.

(A) Purpose

- (1) The city council declares as a matter of public policy that the preservation, protection, perpetuation and use of areas, places, buildings, structures, and other objects having special historical interest or value is a public necessity and is required in the interest of the health, safety, welfare and prosperity of the people.
- (2) Additionally, this overlay district has the purpose to:
 - Safeguard the heritage of the city by preserving sites and structures which reflect elements of the city's cultural, social, economic, political, visual or architectural history;
 - Protect and enhance the city's appeal to residents, visitors and tourists and serve as a support and stimulus to business and industry;
 - Foster civic pride in the beauty and notable accomplishments of the past; and,
 - Promote the preservation and continued use of historic sites and structures for the education and general welfare of the people of the city.

Alternative Options:

The City Council could elect not to approve the Ordinance approving Heritage Preservation Site Designation in the Northfield Historic District. By taking this action, no properties would be added or deleted and the district boundary for the current local Heritage Preservation Site Designation would not be amended.

Financial Impacts:

Approval of the Ordinance approving Heritage Preservation Site Designation will have no direct financial impact on the City of Northfield.

Tentative Timeline:

The first reading of the Ordinance was approved on February 13. The Ordinance will receive a second reading at the meeting on Tuesday, February 20. Following approval, the properties will be nominated to the National Register of Historic Places for inclusion in the Northfield Historic District. The National Register program,

directed by the National Park Service, is administered in each state by its State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO). The process takes about 6 months, but does not involve City staff time apart from submitting the nomination. Due to the specialized process required to nominate multiple properties to the Northfield Historic District, staff recommends utilizing a consultant to create the nomination.

Process:

- Nominations are submitted to SHPO for review. SHPO notifies affected property owners and local governments and solicits public comment. If the owner (or a majority of owners for a district nomination) objects, the property cannot be listed but may be forwarded to the National Park Service for a Determination of Eligibility (DOE).
- Proposed nominations are reviewed by SHPO and the Minnesota Historical Society's State Review Board. The length of this process varies but takes a minimum of 90 days.
- Complete nominations, with certifying recommendations, are submitted by SHPO to the National Park Service in Washington, D.C. for final review and listing by the Keeper of the National Register of Historic Places. The National Park Service makes a listing decision within 45 days.