

EXHIBIT B

FINDINGS OF FACT

The Northfield city ordinances outline, in Chapter 34 – Land Development Code (LDC), Section 8.5.8, the Heritage Preservation Commission’s Certificate of Appropriateness process and approval criteria. The HPC shall consider the following in evaluating an application for a certificate of appropriateness for a zoning certificate and/or building permit. Criterion (A) below must be met and criteria (B) through (G) shall be considered:

Criteria A. For all applications, the proposed action fully complies with all applicable requirements of the LDC;

This finding is met. The site is located in the C1-B: Downtown zoning district and within the H-O: Historic Overlay District, however, due to the history of the site, they have not been zoned, and are included in the right-of-way on the official zoning map. The proposed work is consistent with the requirements of the C1-B, and PB-S: Public Benefit District. The proposed lighting is consistent with the City’s Dark Sky Ordinance.

The proposed work is consistent with the Downtown Preservation Design Guidelines, and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, as identified in the LDC.

Criteria B. That the proposed action is in harmony with the purpose of the H-O district for sites located in the H-O district;

This finding is met. The purpose of the H-O district is:

- (1) The city council declares as a matter of public policy that the preservation, protection, perpetuation and use of areas, places, buildings, structures, and other objects having special historical interest or value is a public necessity and is required in the interest of the health, safety, welfare and prosperity of the people.
- (2) Additionally, this overlay district has the purpose to:
 - (a) Safeguard the heritage of the city by preserving sites and structures which reflect elements of the city's cultural, social, economic, political, visual or architectural history;
 - (b) Protect and enhance the city's appeal to residents, visitors and tourists and serve as a support and stimulus to business and industry;
 - (c) Foster civic pride in the beauty and notable accomplishments of the past; and,
 - (d) Promote the preservation and continued use of historic sites and structures for the education and general welfare of the people of the city.

By preserving the Civil War Monument in place, the fountain, the general location of the Water Street Connection, and the function as a gathering place in the town the proposal preserves the historic functions and features of Bridge Square and Riverside Park. The archaeological monitoring plan will protect existing archaeological resources. The rehabilitation of the space will enhance the city’s appeal and foster civic pride in the beauty and notable accomplishments of the past.

Criteria C, That the proposed action would complement other structures within the H-O district for sites located in the H-O district;

This finding is conditionally met. The proposed rehabilitation enhances the appeal to visitors and residents of the city, increasing the functionality of the space as a public gathering space but, as proposed, includes elements that would detract from or have an adverse impact on other structures in the district. Specifically, the proposed pole-mounted light fixtures, bollards, bike racks, bins, and benches are of an incompatible design, and contrast, and conflict with and detract from the H-O district.

The alternative pole-mounted light fixtures, bollards, bike racks, bins, and benches are compatible with and complement other structures in the H-O district.

An attractive public square will enhance the appeal of the buildings fronting Bridge Square, and the improved pedestrian circulation will facilitate commerce in the mixed-use walkable small-town center that is the context for the district.

Criteria D, That the proposed action is consistent with the Downtown Preservation Design Guidelines for sites located in the H-O district, and consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Treatment of Historic Properties for sites located within or outside the H-O district;

This finding is conditionally met. The Downtown Preservation Design Guidelines are limited in their discussion of Bridge Square and Riverside Park and focus instead on the buildings within the district. The proposed rehabilitation meets the following Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation:

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
 - a. The use as a public square will continue, as will the transportation use, and minimal changes are proposed to the character defining features.
2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
 - a. The historic alignment of Water St. is retained, as is the Civil War Monument, and the historic viewshed of the river. With the exception of the archaeological resources, there are no additional historic materials present.
3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.
 - a. The proposed rehabilitation uses contemporary materials, furnishings, and a contemporary design. Because the furnishings, including streetlights, benches, planters, etc. are not historic or original to the site, the replacement of these with

contemporary features is appropriate and avoids creating a false sense of historical development. The alternative pole-mounted light fixtures, bollards, bike racks, bins, and benches are compatible with and complement other structures in the H-O district.

4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

a. The retention of the fountain, while not yet historic, recognizes the potential future historic value of this feature. The Civil War Monument is now historic, despite not being original. The viewshed is also not original, and exists due to the removal of an original mill structure, this feature has taken on its own historic significance.

5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.

a. Not applicable.

6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

a. Not applicable.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

a. Not applicable.

8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

a. The archaeological resources identified through survey will be monitored and protected via the archaeological monitoring plan.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

a. The new construction, including planting beds, paved paths, walls, and other features will be differentiated from the old, and the massing of the proposed features is compatible with the historic use, adjacent buildings, and overall district.

The alternative pole-mounted light fixtures, bollards, bike racks, bins, and benches are compatible with and complement other structures in the H-O district.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

- a. The proposed new construction may be removed in the future without damaging the essential form and integrity of the historic property.

Criteria E, Consideration should be given to the amount and quality of original material and design remaining in the building or structure when applying criteria, guidelines and standards;

This finding is met. Bridge Square has changed significantly since the establishment of the city. From an unpaved utilitarian space used for the loading and unloading of wagons and trucks, it was eventually paved with creosote blocks and featured a horse-watering trough. It has primarily served as transportation infrastructure and as a public gathering space. Gradually, landscaping and park-like elements have been added and expanded over the past century.

There is little of the original material remaining, however, the Civil War Monument has remained since 1921. The fountain dates to 1980, and is nearing the 50-year threshold to be considered historic. Both of these elements are to remain, while the asphalt and concrete of the curbs, sidewalks, and street surfaces will be replaced as they have reached the end of their useful life.

Criteria F, For new construction, the building or addition should be compatible with: (i) scale, texture, materials, and other visual qualities of the surrounding buildings and neighborhoods; (ii) the height, width, depth, massing and setback of the surrounding buildings; and (iii) the amount of solid wall to window and door openings, and the replacement of window and door openings, should be proportional to that of the surrounding buildings and neighborhood;

This finding is conditionally met. The new construction is consistent with a public square and maintains the historic viewsheds. The alternative pole-mounted light fixtures, bollards, bike racks, bins, and benches are compatible with and complement other structures in the H-O district. It will not detract from the historic character of the district or the adjacent buildings.

Criteria G, Consideration shall be given to clear cases of economic hardship or to deprivation of reasonable use of the owner's property.

This criterion is not applicable.